A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RESEARCH ON THE INFLUENCE OF IRRELEVANT INFORMATION ON PSYCHOLOGICAL JUDGMENTS

Gary J. Gaeth and James Shanteau Kansas State University

HUMAN FACTORS TECHNICAL AREA



U. S. Army

Research Institute for the Behavioral and Social Sciences

September 1981

Approved for public release; distribution unlimited.

88 03 04 078

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE		READ INSTRUCTIONS BEFORE COMPLETING FORM
Research Note 81-25	AID 5 30 S.	3. RECIPIENT'S CATALOG NUMBER
1. TITLE (and Subtitle)		5. TYPE OF REPORT & PERIOD COVERE
A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RESEARCH ON THE INFLUENCE OF IRRELEVANT INFORMATION ON PSYCHOLOGICAL JUDGMENTS		Interim Technical Report
		6. PERFORMING ORG. REPORT NUMBER HIP #81-13
7. AUTHOR(a)		8. CONTRACT OR GRANT NUMBER(#)
Gary J. Gaeth and James Shanteau		MDA903-80-C-0029
PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRES	SS	10. PROGRAM ELEMENT, PROJECT, TASK AREA & WORK UNIT NUMBERS
Department of Psychology Kansas State University Manhattan, Kansas 66506		2Q161102B74 F
11. CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS US Army Research Institute for the Behavioral		12. REPORT DATE
		September 1981
and Social Sciences, 5001 Eisenhower Avenue,		13. NUMBER OF PAGES
Alexandria, VA 22333		10
14. MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS(If different from Controlling Office)		15. SECURITY CLASS. (of this report)
		Unclassified
		15a. DECLASSIFICATION/DOWNGRADING
6. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of this Report)		<u> </u>

16. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of this Report)

Approved for public release; distribution unlimited.

17. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)

18. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES

Human Judgment



19. KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)
Bibliography
Psychology
Irrelevant Information



20. ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)

This bibliography provides a partical listing of published studies which demonstrate an effect of irrelevant information on human judgment. While it is apparent that there are numerous studies of irrelevance, there have been no previous efforts to compile a listing of these papers. However, it is clear from the bibliography that the use of irrelevant information has been reported in a wide range of research areas. Moreover, there are a number of parallel research efforts on irrelevance which have not been previously documented.

DD FORM 1473 EDITION OF 1 NOV 65 IS OBSOLETE

Unclassified

Adamson, R., & Everett, K. Response modification by "irrelevant" stimulus attributes. <u>Psychonomic Science</u>, 1969, 14(2), 81.

- Anderson, N. H., & Grant, D. A. A test of a statistical learning theory model for two-choice behavior models with double stimulus events. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1957, 54(5), 305-317.
- Archer, E. J., Bourne, L. E., Jr., & Brown, F. G. Concept identification as a function of irrelevant information and instructions. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1955, 49(3), 153-164.
- Bear, G., & Hodun, A. Implicational principles and cognition of confirmatory, contradictory, incomplete, and irrelevant information. <u>Journal of Personality and Social Psychlogy</u>, 1975, 32(4), 594-604.
- Besner, D., & Coltheart, M. Mental size scaling examined. Memory and Cognition, 1976, 4(5), 525-531.
- Biederman, I., & Checkosky, S. F. Processing redundant information. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1970, 83(3), 486-490.
- Blin, J. M. How relevant are 'irrelevant' alternatives? Theory and Decision, 1976, 7, 95-105.
- Bonnet, M. H., & Webb, W. B. The effect of repetition of relevant and irrelevant tasks over day and night work periods. <u>Ergonmonics</u>, 1978, <u>21</u>(12), 999-1005.
- Bourne, L. E., Jr. <u>Human conceptual behavior</u>. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1960.
- Bundesen, C., & Larsen, A. Visual transformation of size.

 Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception
 and Performance, 1975, 1(3), 214-220.
- Bush, E. S., & Cohen, L. B. Effects of relevant and irrelevant labels on short-term memory in nursey-school children. <u>Psychonomic Science</u>, 1970, <u>18</u>(4), 228-229.

Castellan, N. J. Jr. Multiple-cue probability learning with irrelevant cues. <u>Organizational Behavior and Human Performance</u>, 1973, 2(1), 16-29.

- Cohen, G. Differential effects of irrelevant dimensions in three-shape recognition tasks. <u>British Journal of Psychology</u>, 1971, 62(2), 151-156.
- Cottrell, N. B., Rajecki, D. W., & Smith, D. U. The energizing effects of postdecision dissonance upon performace of an irrelevant task. <u>Journal of Social Psychology</u>, 1974, 93, 81-92.
- Crawford, A. The perception of light signals: The effect of the number of irrelevant lights. <u>Ergomonics</u>, 1962, 5, 417-428.
- Derks, P. L. Effect of run length on the "Gambler's Fallacy". <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1963, 65(2), 213-214.
- Dixon, P., & Just, M. Normalization of irrelevant dimensions in stimulus comparisons. <u>Journal of Experimenal Psychology: Human Perception and Performance</u>. 1978, 4(1), 36-46.
- Egeth, H. Selective attention. <u>Psychological Bulletin</u>, 1967, 67, 41-57.
- Eimas, P. D. Effects of overtraining and age on intradimensional and extradimensional shift in children.

 <u>Journal of Experimental Child Psychology</u>, 1966, 3, 348-355.
- Eimas, P. D. Optional shift behavior in children as a function of overtraining, irrelevant stimuli, and age.

 Journal of Experimental Child Psychology, 1967, 5, 332-340.
- Eimas, P. D. Effects of overtraining on irrelevant stimuli and training task reversal on reversal discrimination learning in children. <u>Journal of Experimental Child Psychology</u>, 1966, 3, 315-323.
- Elliott, L. S., & Johnson, J. T. Orienting reflex in intellectually average and retarded-children to a relevant and irrelevant stimulus. <u>American Journal of Mental Development</u>, 1973, 76(3), 332.
- Epstein, W. Mechanisms of directed forgetting. In G. H. Bower (Ed.), The Psychology of Learning and Motivation, Vol. 6, Acedemic Press: New York, 1972.

- Evans, R. A., & Beedle, R. K. Discrimination learning in mentally-retarded children as a function of irrelevant dimension variability. <u>American Journal of Mental Development</u>, 1970, 74(4), 568.
- Flowers, J. L., Warner, J. L., & Polansky, M. L. Response and encoding factors in "ignoring" irrelevant information. Memory and Cognition, 1979, 7(2), 86-94.
- Folkard, S., & Greeman, A. L. Salience, induced muscle tension and the ability to ignore irrelevant information. <u>Ouarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1974, 26, 360-367.
- Ford, J. M., Hink, R., Hopkins, W. F.. Roth, W. T., Pfefferbaum, A., & Kopell, B.S. Age effects on event-related potentials in a selective attention task. <u>Journal of Gerontology</u>, 1979, 34(3), 388-395.
- Fromkin, H. L., Goldstein J. H., & Brock, T. C. The role of irrelevant derogation in vicarious aggression catharsis: A field experiment. Krannert Graduate School, Paper No. 447, Purdue University. Laffette, Ind.: Purdue University Press, 1974.
- Gaeth, G. J. A comparison of lecture and interactive training designed to reduce the influence of interfering materials: An application to soil science. Masters Thesis, Kansas State University, 1980.
- Gaeth, G. J., and Shanteau, J. <u>Hand method of soil texture assessment</u>: A <u>psychological analysis of accuracy</u>. Paper presented at the SCSS conference, Fort Collins, Colorado, 1980.
- Giambra, L. M. Effect of number of irrelevant dimensions with ten concept types on attribute identification task in the selection mode with exemplar and non-exemplar start cards. Psychomonic Science, 1969, 14(2), 75-76.
- Goldstein, I. L., & Allen, J. C. Effects of irrelevant stimuli on the processing of information in complex displays. <u>Journal of Applied Psychology</u>, 1971, <u>55</u>(2), 110-113.
- Goldstein, I. L., Johnston, W. A., & Howell, W. C. Complex vigilance: Relevant and irrelevant signls. Journal of Applied Psychology, 1969, 53(1), 45-48.
- Gordon, I. E. Donders' c-reactions and irrelevant stimulus variety. <u>British Journal of Psychology</u>, 1970, 61(3), 359-363.

- Grant, D. A., & Curran, J. F. Relative difficulty of number, form, and color concepts of a Weigle-type problem using unsystematic number cards. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1952 43, 408-413.
- Griffitt, W., and Jackson, T. Influence of information about ability and nonability on personnel selection decisions. <u>Psychological Reports</u>, 1970, <u>27</u>, 959-962.
- Heslin, R., Blake, B., & Rotten, J. Information search as a function of stimulus uncertainty and the importance of the response. <u>Journal of Personality and Social Psychology</u>, 1972, 23(3), 333-339.
- Himmelfarb, S., & Youngblood, J. Effects of factual information on creating resistance to emotional appeals. Psychonomic Science, 1969, 14(6), 267-270.
- Hodge, M. H. Competing responses and processing of irrelevant information. Memory and Cognition, 1973, 1(2), 124-128.
- Hodge, M. H., & Reid, L. S. Influence of similarity between relevant and irrelevant information upon a complex identification task. <u>Perception and Psychophysics</u>, 1971, 10(4A), 193-196.
- Holman, E. W. Irrelevant-incentive learning with flavors in rats. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1980, 6(2), 20-24.
- Hoyer, W. J., Rebok, G. W., & Sved, S. M. Effects of varying irrelevant information on adult age differences in problem solving. <u>Journal of Gerontology</u>, 1979, 34(4), 553-560.
- Hyman, L. M. Effects of irrelevant dimensions and stimuli on two-choice discrimination learning by children. Psychonomic Science, 1971, 22(4), 249-250.
- Jacoby, L. L., & Radtke, R. C. Effects of contiguity and meaningfulness of relevant and irrelevant attributes on concept formation. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1969, 81(3), 454-459.
- Johannsen, W. J. Concept identification under misinformative and subsequent informative feedback conditions. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1962, 64(6), 631-635.
- Johnston, W. A., & Howell, W. C. Complex vigilance: Relevant and irrelevant signals. <u>Journal of Applied Psychology</u>, 1969, 53(1), 45-48.

Johnston, W. A., and Wilson, J. Perceptual processing of nontargets in an attention task. <u>Memory and Cognition</u>, 1980, 8(4), 372-377.

- Kanheman, A., and Tversky, A. Subjective probability: A judgment of representativeness. <u>Cognitive Psychology</u>, 1971, 3, 430-454.
- Kausler, D. H., & Kleim, D. M. Age differences in processing relevant versus irrelevant stimuli in multiple-item recognition learning. <u>Journal of</u> <u>Gerontology</u>, 1978, 33(1), 87-93.
- Kepros, P. G., & Bourne, L. E. Jr. Identification of biconditional concepts: Effects of number of relevant and irrelevant dimensions. <u>Canadian Journal of</u> <u>Psychology</u>, 1966, <u>20</u>(2), 198-207.
- Krischer, J. P. The mathematics of cleft palate treatment evaluation: Measuring the desirability of treatment outcomes. The Cleft Palate Journal, 1976, 13(2), 165-180.
- Krueger, L. E. Effect of irrelevant surrounding material on speed of same-different judgment of two adjacent letters. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1973, 98(2), 252-259.
- Larsen, A., & Bndesen, C. Size scaling in visual pattern recognition. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>: <u>Human Perception and Performance</u>. 1979, 4(1), 1-20.
- Layton, B. Perceptual noise and aging. <u>Psychological</u> <u>Bulletin</u>, 1975, <u>82</u>(6), 875-883.
- Levine, J. M. Information seeking with conflicting and irrelevant inputs. <u>Journal of Applied Psychology</u>, 1973, 57(1), 74-80.
- Lichtenstein, S., Earle, T. C., & Slovic, P. Cue utilization in a numerical prediction task. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>: <u>Human Perception and Performance</u>. 1975, 104, 77-85.
- Low, L. A., Coste, E. & Kirkup, C. Concept transfer as a function of age and variability of irrelevant features during acqusition. <u>Bulletin of Pschonomic Society</u>, 1978, 12(5), 393-395.
- Low, L. A., Coste, E., & Kirkup, C. Developmental differences in concept transfer as a function of variability of irrelevant features during acquisition. Bulletin of Psychomonic Society, 1980, 16(1), 19-22.

Low, L. A., Woolverton, M., & Lusignan, R. Influence of variability of irrelevant features on concept transfer in children. <u>Bulletin of Psychonomic Society</u>, 1976, 8(6), 422-424.

- Mason, M., & Brandau, R. Effect of irrelevant differences on <u>same-different</u> judgments. Unpublished Manuscript, Iowa State University, 1980.
- Miles, C. G., Westbrook, R. E., & Lorimer, P. W. Problem difficulty and acquisition of stimulus control by an irrelevant feature in the Pigeon. <u>Journal of Comparative and Physiological Psychology</u>, 1969, 68(2), 249-253.
- Milgram, N. A., & Noce, J. S. Relevant and irrelevant verbalization in discrimination and reversal learning by normal and retarded children. <u>Journal of Educational Psychology</u>, 1968, <u>59</u>(3), 169-175.
- Miller, J., & Bauer, D. W. Irrelevant differences in the "same"-"different" task. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1981, 7(1), 196-207.
- Mitchell, H. E., & Byrne, D. Minimizing the influence of irrelevant factors in the courtroom: The defendant's character, judge's instructions, and authoritarianism. Paper presented at the <u>Annual Meeting of the Midwestern Psychological Association</u>, May, 1972, Cleveland.
- Modigliani, V., & Rizza, J. P. Conservation of simple concepts as a functon of deletion of irrelevant attributes. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1971, 90(2), 280-286.
- Montague, W. E. Effect of irrelevant information on a complex auditory-discrimination task. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1965, 69, 230-236.
- Morin, R. E. Factors influencing rate and extent of learning in the presence of misinformative feedback.

 <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1955, 49(5), 343-351.
- Morin, R. E., Forrin, B., & Archer, W. Information processing behavior: The role of irrelevant information. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1961, 61(1), 89-96.
- Nagy, G. How are personnel selection decisions made? An analysis of decision strategies in a simulated personnel selection task. Doctoral Dissertation, Kansas State University, 1981.

Navon, D. Irrelevance of figural identity for resolving ambiguities in apparent motion. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1976, 2(1), 130-138.

- Norman, K. L. Dynamic processes in stimulus integration theory: The effects of feedback on averaging of motor movements. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1974, 102(3), 399-408.(a)
- Norman, K. L. Rule learning in a stimulus integration task. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1974, 103(5), 941-947.(b)
- Norman, K L. Effect of feedback on the weights and subjective values in an information integration model.

 Organizational Behavior and Human Performance, 1976, 17, 367-387.
- Osburn, H. G., Timmreck, C., & Bigby, D. Effect of dimensional relevance on accuracy of simulated hiring decisons by employment interviewers. <u>Journal of Applied Psychology</u>, 1981, 66(2), 159-165.
- Overing, R. L. R., & Travers, R. M. W. Variation in the amounts of irrelevant cues in training and test conditions and the effect upon transfer. <u>Journal of Educational Psychology</u>, 1967, <u>58</u>(1), 62-68.
- Phelps, R. H. Expert livestock judgment: A descriptive analysis of the development of expertise. Doctoral Dissertation, Kansas State University, 1977.
- Pishkin, V. Effects of probability of misinformation and number of irrelevant dimensions upon concept identification. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1960, 59(6), 371-378.
- Price, L. E., Spiker, C. C. Effect of similarity of irrelevant stimuli on performance in discrimination learning problems. <u>Journal of Experimental Child Psychology</u>, 1967, 5, 324-331.
- Rabbitt, P. M. Ignoring irrelevant information. <u>British</u>
 <u>Journal of Psychology</u>, 1964, <u>55</u>(4), 403-414.
- Rabbitt, P. An age decrement in the ability to ignore irrelevant information. <u>Journal of Gerontology</u>, 1965, 20, 233-238.
- Rabbitt, P. M. A. Learning to ignore irrelevant information. American Journal of Psychology, 1967, 130(1), 1-13.

Rice, M. F. Influence of irrelevant biographical information in teacher evaluation. <u>Journal of Educational Psychology</u>, 1975, 67(5), 658-662.

- Ryack, B. L., deDombal, F. T., Moeller, G., Robinson, K., & Softley, A. The effects of indicant sets on the accuracy of computerized diagnosis of abdominal pain. Paper presented at the <u>Second Annual Meeting of the Society for Medical Decision Making</u>, 1980, Washington, D.C.
- Sanchez, H., & Clark, N. T. Relevant versus irrelevant drive in social facilitation: Are audiences aversive? Paper presented at the M. P. A. Convention, April 1981, Detriot, Michigan.
- Schonfield, D. Translations in gerontology-from lab to life: Utilizing information. <u>American Psychologist</u>, 1974, 29, 796-801.
- Shaklee, H., & Mims, M. Sources of error in judging event covariations: Effects of memory demands. Submitted to Memory and Cognition, 1980.
- Shanteau, J. Information theory applied to the training of experts. Paper presented at <u>AIDS</u> meeting, November, 1979, New Orleans., 1979.
- Shanteau, J., & Anderson, N. H. Integration theory applied to judgments of the value of information. Journal of Experimental Psychology, 1972, 9(2), 266-275.
- Shanteau, J., & Gaeth, G. J. Training experts to ignore irrelevant information. Paper presented at <u>Psychomonic Society Meetings</u>, 1979, Phoenix.
- Shantz, C. U. Effects of redundant and irrelevant information of children's seriation ability. <u>Journal of Experimental Child Psychology</u>, 1967, 5, 208-222.
- Shepp, B. E., & Gray, V. A. Effects of variable-within and variable-between irrelevant stimuli on dimensional learning and transfer. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1971, 89(1), 32-39.
- Shugan, S. M. The cost of thinking. <u>Journal of Consumer</u> Research, September, 1980, 7, 99-111.
- Shweder, R. A. Likeness and likelihood in everyday thought: Magical thinking in judgment about personality. Current Anthropology, 1977, 18(4), 637-658.

- Singleton, W. T. (Ed.) The analysis of practical skills (Vol. 1). Baltimore: Universtiy Park Press, 1977.
- Snapper, K. J., & Peterson, C. P. Information seeking and data diagnosticity. <u>Journal of Experimental Psychology</u>, 1971, 87(3), 429-433.
- Streufert, S. C. Effects of information relevance on decision making in complex environments. <u>Memory and Cognition</u>, 1973, 1(3), 224-228.
- Sue, S., Smith, R. E., & Caldwell, C. Effects of admissible evidence on the decisions of simulated jurors: A moral dilemma. <u>Journal of Applied Social Psycholology</u>, 1973, 3(4), 345-353.
- Treisman, A. Monitoring and storage of irrelevant messages in selective attention. <u>Journal of Verbal Learning</u>, 1964, <u>3</u>, 449-459.
- Troutman, C. M., & Shanteau, J. Inferences based on nondiagnostic information. <u>Organizational Behavioral and Human Performance</u>, 1977, 19, 43-55.
- Tversky, A., & Kanhneman, D. Judgment under uncertainty: Heuristics and biases. Science, 1974, 185, 1124-1131.
- Tversky, A. Features of similarity. <u>Psychological</u> <u>Review</u>, 1977, <u>84</u>(4), 327-352.
- Walker, C. M. Concept identification as a function of relevant and irrelevant information. unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Utah, 1957.
- Walker, C. M., & Bourne, L. E., Jr. The identification of concepts as a function of amount of relevant and irrelevant information. <u>American Journal of Psychology</u>, 1961, 74, 410-417.
- Walker, D. W., & Means, L. W. Single-alternation performance in rats with hippocampal lesions: Disruption by an irrelevant task interposed during the intertrial interval. Behavior Biology, 1973, 9(1), 93-104.
- Wallsten, T. S. <u>Bias in evaluating diagnostic information</u>. Report No. 157, L. L. Thurstone Psychometric Laboratory, Chapel Hill, N.C., 1978.
- Wallsten, T. S. <u>Processes and models to describe choice</u> and inference. Report Number 158, The L. L. Thurstone Psychometric Laboratory, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, January, 1979.

Weiner, B., & Reed, H. Effects of the instructional set to remember and to forget on short-term retention: Studies of rehersal contol and rehersal inhibition (repression). Journal of Experimental Psychology, 1969, 79, 229-232.

interior to the state of the st

- Wells, G. L., Lindsay, R. C. L. On estimating the diagnosticity of eyewitness nonidentification. <u>Psychological Bulletin</u>, 1980, <u>88</u>(3), 776-784.
- Weiss, W. Influence of an irrelevant stimulus attribute on numerostiy judgments. <u>Perception and Motor Skills</u>, 1965, 4, 190.
- Wheeler, J. A. The outsider. Time, March 12, 1979.
- Williams, C. The effect of an irrelevant dimension on "same-different" judgements of multi-dimensional stimuli. Ouartely Journal of Experimental Psychology, 1974, 26, 26-31.
- Youngblood, J., & Himmelfarb, S. The effects of prior neutral messages on resistance to evaluative communication. <u>Psychonomic Science</u>, 1972, <u>29</u>(6A), 348-350.